DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 187 027 EA 012 704

AUTHOR Kottkamp, Robert
TITLE Student Choice and Denial in a Public School of Choice.
PUB DATE Apr 79
NOTE 34p.; Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Association (Boston, MA, April 7-11, 1980).

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC02 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS *Academic Achievement; High School Students; Literature Reviews; *Nontraditional Education; Public Schools; Secondary Education; Statistical Studies; *Student Adjustment; Student Attitudes; Student Behavior
IDENTIFIERS *School Choice

ABSTRACT

This paper reports on the commitments to school of two groups of high school juniors and seniors: self-affiliated students who were responsible for the choice of the school they attended and compelled students who were forced by their parents to attend their school when they actively desired to attend another school. A sample of 19 compelled students and 21 self-affiliated students was surveyed. Results showed that self-affiliated students show greater commitment towards their school as a formal organization, including its behavioral and academic expectations and its extracurricular activities. The report provides an analysis of case studies, based on student interviews, of the school accommodation strategies and resulting behavior of students in both groups. The paper concludes that allowing choice to upper level high school students can have positive outcomes for both the individual student and the organization. (Author/LD)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH, EDUCATION & WELFARE
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION

THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRODUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGINATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT OFFICIAL NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY

ED187027

Student Choice and Denial in a Public School of Choice

Robert Kottkamp

Graduate School of Education

Rutgers University

EA 012 704

Presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Association in San Francisco, April 1979.

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

R. Kottkamp

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

Purpose

The lack of research on the conditions under which students are recruited into schools and the results on these modes of affiliation for both the school and the individual student is noted by Bidwell (1970). Nault's (1977) study of the relationship between two modes of school affiliation--voluntary and compelled--and subsequent commitment toward various dimensions of schooling among freshmen students attending Catholic high schools began an exploration into the void noted by Bidwell. The purpose of this paper is to extend into the public school sector and to further develop the empirical inquiry of one aspect of school choice begun by Nault.

Background and Problem

Within recent history in the precollegiate, public sector of schooling (with the exception of a few open enrollment plans and specialized schools such as technical schools) user choice has been absent, and the affiliation of students with their schools has generally been determined by two conditions: the legal condition of compulsory attendance, typically encompassing the years from six to sixteen, and the customary condition of administrative assignment to a particular school on the basis of the student's place of residence. Because these conditions obtain in public education, Nault (1977) went to the private sector of schooling in order to find the variation in student affiliation which was necessary to address the need for research raised by Bidwell. Students attending Catholic high schools have at the very least the option of attending a public school and sometimes the added option of one or more other private schools. Nault found two extremes of an affiliation

continuum in Catholic schools: self-affiliated students who were largely responsible for the choice of the schools they attended and compelled students who were forced by parents to attend their schools when they actively desired to attend another potential option.

Literature on client-organization affiliation (Bidwell, 1970; Carlson, 1964; Etzioni, 1961, 1964) contains conceptual frameworks which address the relationship between client affiliation or recruitment to and subsequent participation in an organization. Although writers in this area begin from different perspectives and use slightly different concepts,[1] when taken together this literature presents a consistent theoretical base from which to develop hypotheses for empirical testing. A sketch of the theoretical argument follows. Clients who affiliate with organizations voluntarily, in response to normative recruitment appeals and with the expectation of fulfilling felt-need dispositions, are likely to exhibit behavior consonant with organizational expectations and to require relatively small amounts of organizational energy in order to socialize them into expected role performance. Conversely, clients who are coercively affiliated with an organization are likely to be alienated from the organization and to behave in ways which are dissonant with its expectations for them. Subsequent to the entry of such clients, the organization may have to expend large amounts of energy to socialize them into acceptable role performance. However, energy devoted to socialization or to continued control

---

[1]For a more detailed review of this literature as it relates to schooling see Nault (1975, 1977).

through coercive means detracts from primary goal achievement. As it relates to school organizations, this literature seems to indicate that the use of coercion (whether parental or legal-customary) in affiliating students with schools is an inappropriate means of recruitment which simply reduces the likelihood that students will exhibit committed involvement in the role schools expect of them. In fact, other literature suggests that involuntary recruitment of students to schools often results in undesired behavior such as situational retirement, rebellion, seeking side-payments (Carlson, 1964), manipulation (Henry, 1963), apathy, withdrawal, and protest (Spady, 1974).

Nault (1977) demonstrated empirical support for client-organization affiliation theory in schools. He investigated the differential commitment to four aspects of schooling exhibited by two cohorts of Catholic freshmen, those voluntarily affiliated with their schools and those compelled to affiliate by parents. The four dimensions of commitment were: toward school as a formal organization; its behavioral expectations; its academic expectations; and its extracurricular activities. In all cases, Nault found that cohorts of voluntarily affiliated students were significantly more committed than their compelled counterparts.

Within the last decade some educators and critics (Coons and Sugarman, 1978; Fantini, 1973; National Commission for the Reform of Secondary Education, 1973; Pratte, 1973; V. Smith, 1973; The Panel on Youth of the President's Science Advisory Committee, 1973) have questioned both the standardization of the "one best system" and the customary condition of administrative assignment to school based on residence found in most public school systems. Although

varying in specifics, these parties have generally advocated the development of multiple and distinctive alternative modes of education and the replacement of customary assignment with affiliation decisions made by school users themselves.

A few public school systems have implemented schools of choice programs which encompass both pluralism and user choice. One such system, River City,[2] is the setting for this study. In this community high school juniors and seniors have a potential choice among five distinct school-within-a-school alternative programs. All programs are housed within a single physical plant, and they vary on dimensions of curriculum (e.g., general/college prep, fine arts, vocational) and locus of responsibility for direction of student learning (i.e., high teacher direction to high student direction). In this system a student may choose an alternative so long as at least one parent consents. It was reasoned that not all parents would accede to their childrens' wishes and that a population of both self-affiliated and compelled students similar to those studied by Nault (1977) might be found. This assumption proved to be correct. Given a school of choice setting which contained students affiliated with their alternatives in various ways, it was then possible to address the affiliation-outcome relationship in a public school context.

An examination of the rationale underlying River City's Education By Choice program (hereafter EBC) also reveals the following set of postulates: (1) students and teachers have varying needs and varying learning or teaching styles, (2) numerous educational options should be offered to meet the varying

---

[2]River City is a pseudonym.

needs and styles, (3) students and teachers are able to recognize their own needs and styles, (4) they will self-select options which are congruent with their own needs and learning styles, (5) congruence will result in greater satisfaction, responsible behavior, and enhanced learning. These postulates find conceptual and some empirical support in person-environment interaction research (Astin, 1970; Holland, 1973; Pervin, 1968; Stern, 1970), most of which is centered in studies of college students who, it may be generally assumed, were voluntarily affiliated with their colleges.[3] In this tradition individuals are seen as having needs and environments as exerting "presses" or characteristic constellations of supports and demands upon those in the environments. It is hypothesized that a congruent person-environment relationship is likely to produce high levels of performance, satisfaction, and personal adjustment. Conversely, dissonant person-environment interaction is likely to produce the opposite outcomes. This general hypothesis has received limited empirical support (Walsh, 1973). Hunt and Sullivan (1974) and Thelen (1968) have researched matching models with younger children. These studies lend further support to the general person-environment interaction model, though they are restricted to cognitive congruence and learning outcomes.

It is now possible to draw together the two conceptual frameworks as they relate to public schools of choice. Schools which offer choices to students do so with the assumption that congruent relationships will be established and that congruence will result in positive outcomes for the school and the student. Such schools find conceptual and limited empirical support in the

---

[3]See Walsh (1973) for a detailed review of this literature.

person-environment interaction tradition. Further, in the schools of choice strategy it is assumed that students will voluntarily affiliate with their alternatives (on the basis of matching felt-needs with the environment perceived most likely to fulfill them) and that because they are voluntarily affiliated they will enter the organization predisposed toward committed rather than alienated involvement.

With this background, four conceptual hypotheses were framed for testing in the public schools of choice context:

H_1 Voluntarily affiliated students will be more committed to the behavioral expectations of their school than compelled students.

H_2 Voluntarily affiliated students will be more committed to the extracurriculum than compelled students.

H_3 Voluntarily affiliated students will be more committed to general classroom expectations than compelled students.

H_4 Voluntarily affiliated students will display higher academic achievement than compelled students.

Methodology

Sample. All students (juniors and seniors) in all five alternative schools of the EBC program were surveyed with a seven question instrument designed to identify a population of voluntarily affiliated and compelled students. The operations used to define these two affiliation poles were similar to those employed by Nault (1977). Voluntary students were defined as those who perceived that they made their choice of school without parental intervention or consultation. Compelled students were those who perceived parental compulsion to attend their present school when at the time of affiliation they

desired to attend another alternative. Of the 1122 EBC students, 92 percent returned signed, usable surveys. A total of 518 voluntary students were located; each alternative school contained a sizable percentage of its population in this category. However, only 19 compelled students were located. All of these students were located in only two alternatives. These options could be characterized as offering a general/college prep curriculum and being toward the pole of teacher responsibility for direction of learning. They were the two most similar alternatives of the total set of five. It was reasoned that variance in the structures and climates of the three schools containing no compelled students might confound an analysis of the affiliation-outcome relationship. Consequently, these three schools were dropped from further analysis.

The total population of compelled students was used in the study. A sample of the voluntary students was drawn from each of the two remaining alternatives by dividing these students into cells by alternative and by sex within alternative. Each student in the four resulting cells was assigned a number and a random number table was used (without replacement) to determine the sample for each cell. The final research sample is shown in Table 1.

Table 1

THE RESEARCH SAMPLE

Students		School Options	
		Alternative 1	Alternative 2
Voluntary	Male	5	5
	Female	5	6
Compelled	Male	7	4
	Female	6	2

Dependent and control variables. The operations for the dependent variables used in testing the conceptual hypotheses are as follows. Commitment to the behavioral expectations of the school was operationalized as the score a student received on a rating scale of seven categories of misconduct (fighting, vandalism, smoking, theft, truency/skipping, disrespect, and other) completed by the Dean of Students. Scores of zero through two were given for each category. The seven scores were summed for each student.

Commitment toward the extracurriculum was operationalized as the number of involvements a student had in the extracurriculum. Participation in each club, athletic team, play, etc. was counted as one involvement. Attendance as a spectator at sports events or attendance at dances was scored as one regardless of the number of such events attended.

Commitment to classroom expectations was operationalized as the score a student received on the Classroom Expectations Scale. Factor analytic techniques were used in developing this seven item scale which purports to measure classroom behaviors and attitudes which are assumed to facilitate or inhibit learning. The scale consists of four, seven point Likert Scale, student report items and three, seven point teacher report items. The average of two academic class teacher reports were used for the teacher items. The scale has face, construct, and predictive validity (Kottkamp, 1979). The coefficient alpha estimate of reliability is .81.

Academic achievement was operationalized as the student's grade point average in academic subjects.

Because students could not be randomly assigned to affiliation modes, data were collected on variables that might be systematically associated with either the independent variable or the dependent variables to the extent that they might offer competing explanations to the hypothesized affiliation-outcome relationships. The control variables were entered to help answer the question: Were there systematic differences between the two cohorts of students before they entered the ERC setting which might explain either their presence in one or the other affiliation group or their behavioral outcomes?

Following Nault (1977), data were collected on the students' socio-economic status (Hollingshead and Redlich, 1958), and two questions assessed relations with parents. The first question asked students how well they "got along with" their parents in comparison with the way close friends got along with their parents; the second asked for the number of decisions parents allowed

them to make on their own compared with close friends and parents. The two questions were answered on five point scales (e.g., much better . . . much worse). These data were collected because of evidence that parent-child conflict is associated with lower school performance (Lavin, 1965).

Other control data were collected on students' attitudes and performance in their sophomore year, the year before voluntary or compelled affiliation in the EBC program. The sophomore grade point average, operationalized identically to the current year GPA, and the composite score on the Iowa Test of Educational Development were collected for each student. The Dean of Men and the Dean of Women in the sophomore building filled out the same seven item misconduct rating scale as described above. Attitudes toward various aspects of schooling during the sophomore year were assessed through scores on the River City All-Choice Continuum, a locally developed attitude inventory. This instrument contains seven, five item scales (School-in-General, Assignments and Instruction, Teachers, Peers, Administrators, School Climate, River City) and was developed as an evaluation instrument for the EBC program. The set of scales was assessed to be valid and reliable by Sherich (1975). In addition, data on sex and school type were used as controls. Previous research in this setting (Havighurst et. al., 1962) had indicated the importance of sex type, and it was reasoned that differences in school structure and climate might affect student outcomes in some consistent pattern.

Design. Data analysis occurred in two stages. First, an analysis was made to determine whether there were important differences between affiliation groups along three dimensions of commitment and academic achievement.

Second, control variables which might be related to the dependent or independent variables were analyzed as possible competing explanations to the affiliation-outcome hypothesis.

Scores of the two affiliation cohorts on the Dean of Students' reports of misconduct were analyzed through simple percentages and a chi-square test. The remaining criterion variables used to measure commitment and academic achievement were analyzed by comparison of mean cohort scores through three-way analysis of variance procedures. The design is a fixed effects model with three main effects: affiliation factor, sex factor, and school factor. Each factor has two levels. The affiliation factor, of major interest, was entered into the analysis last to provide the most stringent test of the affiliation-outcome hypothesis. Colinearity between affiliation and the sex or school factors would be removed and attributed to either sex or school before affiliation was entered. Thus, only unique variance was attributed to affiliation.

In the second phase of analysis, control variables were introduced to determine whether they might offer a competing explanation to affiliation for mean differences in the commitment and achievement variables. The first step in the supplementary analysis was to answer the question: Were there systematic and important differences between the two affiliation groups on the control variables (SES; relations with parents; sophomore misconduct, GPA, and achievement test scores; and seven attitude scales) before they entered the EBC setting? The appropriate statistical test--chi-square or t-test--was run on the control variables to answer the question. When the statistical test indicated a significant difference between the affiliation cohorts on a control variable,

that control was then entered into another set of appropriate tests, either three-way analysis of variance or two-way analysis of variance with a covariate. The factors in these analyses were sex type, control variable, and affiliation mode, which was again entered last.[4] These secondary procedures with control variables made it possible to determine whether variation in the criterion measure could be accounted for by the control variable, whether the affiliation factor continued to explain a significant amount of variance in the criterion measures after adjusting for the control variable, and whether the secondary findings could be generalized across sex type.

A significance level of .05 was accepted in all statistical tests.

Interviews. The methodology described above allows for testing specific hypotheses and gives indication whether the affiliation-commitment relationship found by Nault (1977) also exists in the public setting. However, quantitative methodology imposes "black box" conditions. The inputs (affiliation) and the outputs (commitment and achievement) are seen, but the dynamics linking these two sets of variables are not available for scrutiny. Because investigation of the affiliation-outcome relationship is still exploratory, a decision was made to gather detailed interview data from the student sample in an attempt to further illuminate the dynamics of school accommodation as they relate to the mode of student affiliation. In this respect, the present study moves into new territory.

All students in the sample were formally interviewed with a schedule containing twenty-four, open-ended questions which tapped the events of each

---

[4]School type was dropped in the secondary analysis because it showed little explanatory power in the primary analysis, whereas sex type showed more explanatory power.

student's affiliation process and subsequent accommodation to numerous aspects of schooling. With each student's permission, the interview (conducted in May of the affiliation year) was taped and later reduced to a verbatim typescript. Interviews varied in length from thirty-five minutes to an hour and a half, with a mean of slightly under an hour; they yielded rich data.

The analysis of these data was guided by the general problem question, the conceptual framework of client-organization affiliation, and Etzioni's (1975) flow model of member recruitment and involvement. The analysis involved a process of concept development and model or miniature theory building (L. Smith, 1973) typically described as grounded theory development (Glaser and Strauss, 1967). Examples of this general approach may be found in Becker et. al., (1961, 1968), Smith and Geoffrey (1968), and Smith and Keith (1971). Because of the limited length of this paper and because of the accepted practice of detailed description preceding analysis in qualitative studies, only a few highlights of the qualitative analysis are presented in a later portion of this paper.[5]

Quantitative Results

Two sets of empirical findings help to further knowledge of school choice among high school students. The first set contains percentages and distributions of students in the various affiliation categories; the second set contains results obtained in tests of the affiliation-outcome hypotheses.

The percentages and distributions of students by affiliation mode and alternative school are detailed in Table 2, and are noteworthy findings. While 50 percent of all EBC juniors and seniors depicted themselves as voluntarily

---

[5]A more detailed analysis is contained in Kottkamp (1979).

affiliated, only 2 percent perceived themselves as compelled. The remaining 48 percent fall between these extremes, but the majority of them would fall along the continuum between the midpoint (student and parents had about equal input in the decision) and a point close to voluntarism (parents had minimal influence on the decision). Clearly, in the EBC setting a great deal of student as opposed to parental choice was the norm. In comparison, among the six suburban Catholic schools surveyed by Nault (1975) a mean of 25 percent of the freshmen were voluntarily affiliated and a mean of 10.3 percent were compelled. The differences in distributions between the two studies could be accounted for by numerous variables, but differences in student maturity, and assumed differences in religious background of the parent constituencies are likely candidates.

The distribution of affiliation types among alternative schools is also interesting and perhaps speaks to some concerns when a semi-market circumstance is established in the public sector of schooling. The schools generally considered most "strict" (Traditional) and most "lenient" (Fine Arts) by the students

Table 2

NUMBER OF STUDENTS SURVEYED IN THE FIVE ALTERNATIVE SCHOOLS DETERMINED TO BE SELF-AFFILIATED OR COMPELLED

School	Students Surveyed	Voluntary		Compelled	
		N	%	N	%
Traditional	253	109	43.1	16*	6.3
Flexible	390	202	51.8	6	1.5
Individualized	218	107	49.1	0	0
Fine Arts	49	21	42.9	0	0
Vocational	124	79	63.7	0	0
Total	1034	518	50.1	22	2.1

*This figure includes three students who refused to be interviewed and were thus dropped from the final sample.

have the lowest percentage of voluntary affiliation. It could be speculated that fewer students are willing to pick the "strictest" option on their own and that fewer parents allow their children to choose the most "lenient" option on their own. Vocational is the alternative with the highest percentage of voluntarism. It could be argued that this school offers the most immediate and tangible rewards (present and future employment) of all the alternatives. When considering compelled affiliation, only two schools contained students in this category. Both alternatives have a general/college prep curriculum, and Traditional, which is the more conventional ("Strictest") and teacher centered of the two, contains 73 percent of the small cohort. The pattern of parental compulsion is clearly toward more conventional, structured, and teacher centered options. For example, all but one of the compelled Traditional students initially desired enrollment in Flexible, and all compelled Flexible students desired either the Individualized or Fine Arts options.

Turning to the findings derived from tests of the affiliation-outcome hypotheses, with the exception of participation in extracurricular activities (which was in the predicted direction) the results indicated statistically significant mean differences between the affiliation cohorts in the direction predicted from theory. These findings remained constant after the inclusion of the one control variable on which the two groups showed initial differences.

In analyzing the misconduct reports of the Dean of Students, a three by two crossbreak was set up. The three misconduct categories were: no misconduct (no points), minor misconduct (one point only) and serious misconduct (two or more points). The percentages of students in each category by affiliation group are displayed in Table 3. When chi-square analysis was

applied to the crossbreaks a significant relationship was found between misconduct and affiliation, with compelled students showing more misconduct. In terms of control, no student in the sample was cited as a minor or serious discipline problem by either of the sophomore deans.

Table 3

PERCENT OF SELF-AFFILIATED AND COMPELLED STUDENTS RECEIVING RATINGS OF NO MISCONDUCT, MINOR MISCONDUCT, AND SERIOUS MISCONDUCT FROM THE DEAN OF STUDENTS

Affiliation Group		No Misconduct	Minor Misconduct	Serious Misconduct
Voluntary	(N=21)	95.2% (N=20)	4.8% (N=1)	0% (N=0)
Compelled	(N=19)	73.7% (N=14)	15.8% (N=3)	10.5% (N=2)

Mean extracurricular involvements of students are reported in Table 4. Although the total affiliation group means are in the direction predicted from theory, when the data are broken down by sex and school type there are inconsistencies with the predicted direction. When the data on extracurricular participation were submitted to analysis of variance procedures no significant relationships were found between involvement and affiliation, sex, or school.

The mean scores on the Classroom Expectations Scale are reported in Table 5. The lower the student's score, the more he or she is perceived as exhibiting attitudes and behaviors which are congruent with typical school expectations. Table 5 indicates a consistent pattern of mean scores showing voluntary students to be more in concert with classroom expectations than compelled students. When submitted to analysis of variance the relationship

Table 4

EXTRACURRICULAR PARTICIPATION MEANS FOR SELF-AFFILIATED AND COMPELLED STUDENTS

School or Sex Type	Voluntary Students	Compelled Students
Traditional	2.700 (N=10)	2.000 (N=13)
Flexible	1.636 (N=11)	1.667 (N=6)
Males	2.700 (N=10)	1.818 (N=11)
Females	1.636 (N=11)	2.000 (N=8)
All Students	2.143 (N=21)	1.895 (N=19)

Table 5

MEAN CLASSROOM EXPECTATIONS SCALE SCORES FOR VOLUNTARY AND COMPELLED STUDENTS IN TWO SCHOOLS

School or Sex Type	Voluntary Students	Compelled Students
Traditional	1.95 (N=10)	7.50 (N=13)
Flexible	2.63 (N=11)	6.25 (N=6)
Males	2.15 (N=10)	8.95 (N=11)
Females	2.46 (N=11)	4.56 (N=8)
All Students	2.31 (N=21)	7.11 (N=19)

between scale scores and affiliation showed statistical significance in the direction predicted. As indicated in Table 6, neither sex nor school type were significant.

Table 6

SUMMARY OF ANALYSIS OF VARIANCE IN THE CLASSROOM EXPECTATIONS SCALE

Source of Variation	SS	df	MS	F
B (Sex)	56.132	1	56.132	1.286
C (School)	13.922	1	13.922	.319
A (Affiliation)	195.436	1	195.436	4.476*
B X C	64.797	1	64.797	1.484
B X A	30.579	1	30.579	.700
C X A	6.468	1	6.468	.148
Within Cells	1440.829	33	43.661	
Total	1840.940	39		

* $p < .04$.

Statistical significance indicates only the level of probability that differences between means scores are not an accident based on a particular sample. Of interest beyond level of significance is the amount of variance in the dependent variable which can be attributed to its relationship with the independent variable because the amount of variance indicates the degree of importance that variable has for affecting desired student outcomes. Thus, a statistically significant relationship may have either little or considerable practical import in terms of student outcomes. In this case, the affiliation factor accounts for approximately 11 percent of the variance in student commitment to classroom expectations (with the affiliation factor entered last in the analysis).

This amount of variance makes the relationship interesting in terms of practical considerations.

As indicated in Table 7, when the final outcome variable, academic achievement, is considered, the mean GPAs of the two affiliation groups show differences in the direction predicted; the differences and direction are consistent when the data are broken down by sex and school type. Results of the analysis of variance reported in Table 8 indicate that the affiliation--achievement relationship is statistically significant. Neither sex nor school type showed significance. Further, entered last in the procedure the affiliation factor accounts for approximately 14 percent of the variance in GPA. This percentage appears to have practical importance.

Appropriate chi-square or t-test procedures were then run on the mean scores of the two affiliation groups for the thirteen control variables described

Table 7

JUNIOR YEAR (OR FIRST YEAR OF COMPELLED STATUS) MEAN GPA FOR VOLUNTARY AND COMPELLED STUDENTS

School or Sex Type	Voluntary Students	Compelled Students
Traditional	2.810 (N=10)	1.829 (N=13)
Flexible	2.599 (N=11)	2.102 (N=6)
Males	2.745 (N=10)	1.651 (N=11)
Females	2.658 (N=11)	2.279 (N=8)
All Students	2.700 (N=21)	1.915 (N=19)

Table 8

SUMMARY OF ANALYSIS OF VARIANCE IN GPA

Source of Variation		SS	df	MS	F
B	(Sex)	1.064	1	1.064	1.170
C	(School)	.284	1	.284	.312
A	(Affiliation)	5.399	1	5.399	5.938*
B X C		.686	1	.686	.754
B X A		1.756	1	1.756	1.931
C X A		.939	1	.939	1.032
Within Cells		30.005	33	.909	
Total		39.435	39		

*$p < .02$.

above. There were statistically significant differences between the two affiliation cohorts on only one variable, the Administrator Scale of the River City All-Choice Continuum. The voluntary mean was 62, and the compelled mean was 48, with a higher score indicating more favorable attitudes toward administrators. The Administrator Scale was then introduced into the analysis of the GPA and Classroom Expectations Scale as a covariate; school type was deleted because it had consistently shown little explanatory power.

Table 9 displays the analysis of covariance in the Classroom Expectation Scale. Affiliation retains its statistically significant relationship after the inclusion of the Administrator Scale; no other relationships are significant. The

amount of variance in the scale accounted for by affiliation is approximately 12 percent.

When the analysis of covariance in GPA is viewed in Table 10, the results are seen to be different. The Administrator Scale shows a statistically significant relationship with GPA. However, the affiliation factor, when entered last in the procedure, retains statistical significance after controlling for student attitude toward administrators. Thus, the relationship between affiliation and GPA remains after adding the attitudinal control, but the amount of variance in GPA attributable to affiliation sinks from 13.7 percent in the previous analysis to approximately 9 percent in the presence of the new control variable. The affiliation-GPA relationship remains strong enough to be interesting and of some practical importance.

Table 9

SUMMARY OF ANALYSIS OF COVARIANCE IN THE CLASSROOM EXPECTATIONS SCALE

Source of Variation		SS	df	MS	F
B	(Administrator Scale)	98.462	1	98.462	2.422
C	(Sex)	60.862	1	60.862	1.497
A	(Affiliation)	224.632	1	224.632	5.525*
C X A		33.915	1	33.915	.834
Within Cells		1423.070	35		
Total		1840.940	39		

*$p < .03$.

Table 10

SUMMARY OF ANALYSIS OF COVARIANCE IN GPA

Source of Variation		SS	df	MS	F
B	(Administrator Scale)	5.023	1	5.023	6.042**
C	(Sex)	.659	1	.659	.793
A	(Affiliation)	3.365	1	3.365	4.047*
C X A		1.839	1	1.839	2.213
Within Cells		26.204	32	.831	
Total		37.490	36[a]		

*p .05.

**p .02.

[a]Data were missing for three students in this analysis.

Qualitative Analysis

As indicated previously, the format of this presentation allows only a summary of a few of the insights gleaned from the interview analysis, and those are presented without actual illustrations from student interviews. Further, the qualitative analysis is limited to the Traditional School because it contained thirteen of the total nineteen compelled students (68%) and, thus, provides a sufficient base for analysis of a group perspective.

All compelled students indicated holding negative attitudes toward Traditional School before entering it. These attitudes varied in degree and also in length of duration from three weeks to a full semester after entry. The

denial of autonomy through parental compulsion was a major source of discontent. Beyond compulsion itself there was a constellation of four specific reasons why these students desired entry to a school other than Traditional. When these desires were denied, they contributed to the negative attitudes toward the school of compelled entry. The four reasons for desiring entry to another alternative were: (1) a commonly believed stereotype of Traditional which pictured it as being rigid, boring, personally constraining, and all work, (2) the fear that friendship support groups would be lost because friends were attending other schools, (3) the desire for a "new experience" whereas Traditional was perceived as "more of the same," and (4) the specific appeals of Flexible School, depending on the particular student's orientation, as being either an "easier way out" or as being a context for increasing performance and the amount of accumulated credit. Not all students indicated all of these reasons, but most indicated two or more. The pattern is quite clear.

In contrast, the students voluntarily affiliated with Traditional reported entering it with positive attitudes and expectations. All but one of the voluntary students indicated desiring Traditional because of its structure. Structure was variously described as a needed "push" from teachers, a certain rigor, or required homework and attendance. This school was also chosen because students perceived that enrollment there was directly related to articulation to a desired future status and because it was perceived as having a good faculty. Also in contrast to the compelled cohort, no voluntary student expressed fear of losing friendship support. In fact, several students deliberately chose to separate themselves from old friends in order to attain other outcomes seen as more important than peer group maintenance.

The contrasting findings of the two groups generally support client-organization affiliation theory. However, beyond that they give some specificity to the dynamics occurring in at least one schooling context.

Another interesting finding was that by at least the end of the first semester after entry most compelled students indicated general reconciliation to their situation. Several students went beyond this by both heartily advocating Traditional as the best school and by admitting that with hindsight their parents were correct in ordering them there in the first place. Through analysis of the interviews two major sources of reconciliation were identified. Both of these sources appear to have resulted directly from the restructuring of a modal high school into a series of public schools of choice.

The first complex of reconciling forces was based in increased personal freedom which the larger EBC context provided to all students regardless of their alternative of enrollment and the physical proximity of the options. Although Traditional students experienced strict attendance rules, homework, lecture oriented classes, and supervised study, once they left the actual classroom they also experienced the open-hallway, open-lunch, and generalized increase in personal freedom of the EBC system which could be characterized as the absence of much of the custody-control emphasis which is so typical in high schools. The students universally indicated that they had never experienced so much control over their own lives in school before. This general increase in personal freedom outside the classroom was gratifying to them. The freedom in conjunction with the proximity of other alternatives enabled them to have more access to friends in other schools than anticipated, to attend

other schools in elective courses, to participate in a school-wide extracurricular program, and to discover that their experiences in Traditional were not as drastically different from those in other schools as they had originally imagined.

The second complex of forces which helped to reconcile compelled students resulted from the general school restructuring which produced semi-market circumstances, competition among alternatives for students, and an increased sense of vulnerability among faculty members. These forces seemed to have increased the Traditional School's faculty efforts to "win-over" or socialize students. The attitudes and approaches of teachers toward them were perceived by the compelled students as a primary reconciling force. The teachers were seen as good at their business--instruction--yet more personally interested in students and more humane than the original stereotype had allowed. They were not, interestingly, seen as pandering to student desires in order to attract potential enrollees. Rather, even compelled students experienced their teachers as authentically caring and interested in them. Again, the EBC structure seems to have had some effect. Teachers did not have to fear for a job, but they would not be able to teach in a mode of their choice among colleagues with similar outlooks unless they attracted a sufficient student population to maintain the existence of their particular alternative approach.

In summary, each specific school based factor serving as a source of discontent among compelled students had an amendatory force resulting from one or more aspects of the EBC structure. Negative expectations of Traditional School were counterbalanced by the complex of forces resulting in faculty efforts to "win-over" students and by the general increase in personal freedom

available to all students. Discontent over having the majority of ones friends choose another school was abated by relatively easy access to those friends at numerous times during the school day and by the development of new friendships in the small school atmosphere of Traditional. Discontent based in a desire for new experience and in the appeals of other schools, especially Flexible, was mitigated by proximity as students learned that the differences between schools were not so large as originally anticipated and that everyone had the "new experience" of greater personal freedom outside the classroom.

Discussion

The data in this study are generally supportive of conceptualizations of client-organization affiliation. Specifically, in the four tests of the general affiliation--outcome hypothesis, three criterion variables (behavioral expectations, classroom expectations, achievement) showed statistically significant support for the theoretical framework. The fourth dependent variable, participation in extracurricular events, showed a relationship in the predicted direction but not at a statistically significant level. With control variables in the analysis, affiliation mode continued to account for statistically significant and practically important amounts of variance in classroom expectations and GPA. Further, the interview data gave general support to the conceptual base.

Having indicated the study's general support of the conceptual framework, the caution must be entered that the design is quasi-experimental and that no causal claims can be made about the affiliation-outcome relationships. Efforts were made to control for variables which might have affected the relationships of interest. While these controls are important, they do not replace the

confidence that would be added had random assignment of individuals to affiliation groups been possible. There is still a need to investigate other factors (e.g., a further control for family interaction patterns or long-standing parent child relations) which might account for the affiliation-outcome relationship.

The absence of a significant relationship between affiliation and extracurricular participation contrasts with Nault's (1977) findings. A partial explanation may come from differences between the general circumstances under which students attended schools in the two studies. In Nault's sample, compelled students were geographically isolated from the school (and peers) of desired attendance. In addition, Nault's schools were single sex institutions. Aspects of the extracurricular program, for example, of the public school a student might have desired to attend were simply not available to the compelled Catholic students. In River City on the other hand, regardless of the affiliation mode or the alternative school of enrollment, all students had access to the same extracurricular program. It is also possible that students differentiated in terms of degree and importance between compulsion to the academic classes of a particular alternative (measures of classroom expectations and GPA being based specifically in classes of compelled attendance) and compulsion in a broader sense. This is to suggest that students may have reacted more intensely to the particular object of compulsion than to compulsion in a general sense; they were compelled to particular classes but not a particular extracurricular program. This is supposition and needs further study.

A serendipitous finding is also related to a consideration of extracurricular involvement. It was found that statistically significant differences did exist

between the type of extracurricular involvements of compelled and voluntary students (Kottkamp, 1979). Specifically, compelled students exhibited much greater participation in leadership and service activities. Spady (1971) has demonstrated a strong positive correlation between participation in leadership and service activities and aspirations to attend college and college graduation; he similarly demonstrated a negative correlation between participation in fine arts activities and college aspirations and graduation. This finding is serendipitous and not fully understood. It invites further inquiry.

Another intriguing situation results from the fact that both the quantitative and interview data generally support the affiliation-outcome relationships hypothesized from theory--yet, compelled students in Traditional School also reported a process of reconciliation (socialization) to their compelled condition. This situation also requires further inquiry. It is possible that misconduct, lower grades, and less acceptable classroom behaviors and attitudes occurred early in their careers in Traditional. The data collection did not differentiate between time periods. It is also possible that if initial classroom behavior and achievement was "negative," teachers may have developed expectations for these students that colored later perceptions of behavior and achievement (Braun, 1976; West and Anderson, 1976). If future studies collected data in a time series, perhaps some of these questions could be illuminated.

It is also interesting that half of the students originally surveyed indicated voluntary affiliation while only two percent were compelled. Clearly the norm was toward student choice. As a more general and perhaps more tentative observation after having lived and observed in the setting for a month and

having interviewed forty Traditional and Flexible students, the researcher was impressed by the reasonableness of student behavior when viewed from the perspective of their personal goals and aspirations. It did not appear, at least in these two alternatives, that opening up choice to students also opened up floodgates of unreasonable behavior. In fact, the majority of students were quite aware of "how good they had it" in comparison to their own past experiences and the experiences of friends attending high schools other than EBC. There seemed to be a general awareness and acceptance that these privileges would not continue if they were abused.

This study is exploratory and nonexperimental in design. However, it does add general support to the previous study of the affiliation-outcome relationship. It also begins to explore some of the dynamics of student accommodation to schooling which occur between the measures of affiliation and outcomes. The seeming importance of a milieu of greater personal freedom, of alternative proximity, and of a semi-market situation leading to some sense of faculty vulnerability are also noted. And in practical terms, the study suggests that allowing choice to upper level high school students can have positive outcomes for both the individual student and the organization. Finally, the need for further inquiry is obvious.

References

Astin, A. W. Predicting academic performance in college. New York: Free Press, 1971.

Becker H. S., Geer, B., & Hughes, E. C. Making the grade. New York: Wiley, 1968.

Becker, H. S., Geer, B., Hughes, E., & Strauss, A. L. Boys in white. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1961.

Bidwell, C. E. Students and schools: Some observations on client-serving organizations. In W. R. Rosengren & M. Lefton (Eds.), Organizations and clients: Essays in the sociology of service. Columbus: Charles E. Merrill, 1970.

Braun, C. Teacher expectation: Sociophychological dynamics. Review of Educational Research, 1976, 46, 185-213.

Carlson, R. O. Environmental constraints and organizational consequences: The public school and its clients. In D. E. Griffiths (Ed.), The sixty-third yearbook of the national society for the study of education: Behavioral science and educational administration (Part 2). Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1964.

Coons, J. E., & Sugarman, S. D. Education by choice: The case for family control. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1978.

Etzioni, A. A comparative analysis of complex organizations. Glencoe, Illinois: The Free Press, 1961.

Etzioni, A. Modern organizations. Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey: Prentice-H 1964.

Etzioni, A. A comparative analysis of complex organizations (2nd ed.). New York: The Free Press, 1975.

Fantini, M. D. Public schools of choice. New York: Simon and Schuster, 1973.

Glaser, B. G., & Strauss, A. L. The discovery of grounded theory. Chicago: Aldine Publishing Company, 1967.

Havighurst, R. J., Bowman, P. H., Liddle, G. F., Matthews, C. V. and Pierce, J. V. Growing up in river city. New York: Wiley, 1962.

Henry, J. Culture against man. New York. Vintage Books, 1963.

Holland, J. L. Making vocational choices: A theory of careers. Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey: Prentice-Hall, 1973.

Hollingshead, A. B., and Redlich, F. C. Social class and mental illness: A community study. New York: Wiley, 1958.

Hunt, D. E., & Sullivan, E. V. Between psychology and education. Hinsdale, Illinois: Dryden Press, 1974.

Kottkamp, R. B. Student affiliation and accommodation in public schools of choice. Unpublished manuscript, 1979. (Available from the Graduate School of Education, Rutgers University).

Lavin, D. The prediction of academic performance. New York: Russell Sage Foundation, 1965.

National Commission on the Reform of Secondary Education. The reform of secondary education (B. F. Brown, Chairman). New York: McGraw-Hill, 1973.

Nault, R. The school commitments of nonpublic school freshmen voluntarily and involuntarily affiliated with their schools. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Chicago, 1975.

Nault, R. The school commitments of nonpublic school freshmen voluntarily and involuntarily affiliated with their schools. In D. A. Erickson (Ed.), Educational organization and administration. Berkeley: McCutchan, 1977.

Panel on Youth of the President's Science Advisory Committee. Youth: Transition to adulthood (J. S. Coleman, Chairman). Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1974.

Pervin, L. A. Performance and satisfaction as a function of individual-environment fit. Psychological Bulletin, 1968, 69, 56-68.

Pratte, R. The public school movement. New York: David McKay, 1973.

Scherich, H. H. The validation of a battery of scales for measuring educational attitudes. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Southern Illinois University, 1975.

Smith, L. M. Reflections on trying to theorize from ethnographic data. Paper presented at the meeting of the American Anthropological Association, New Orleans, December 1973.

Smith, L. M., & Geoffrey, W. The Complexities of an urban classroom. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1978.

Smith, L. M., & Keith, P. M. Anatomy of educational innovation: An organizational analysis of an elementary school. New York: Wiley, 1971.

Smith, V. H. Options in public education: The quiet revolution. Phi Delta Kappan, 1973 54, 434-437.

Spady, W. G. Status achievement, and motivation in the high school. School Review, 1971, 79, 379-403.

Spady, W. G. The authority system of the school and student unrest. In C. W. Gordon (Ed.), Seventy-third yearbook on education of the National Society for the Study of Education. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1974.

Stern, G. G. People in context. New York: Wiley, 1970.

Thelen, H. A. Classroom grouping for teachability. New York: Wiley, 1967.

Walsh, W. B. Theories of person-environment interaction: Implications for the college student. Iowa City: American College Testing Program, 1973.

West, C. K., & Anderson, T. H. The question of preponderant causation in teacher expectancy research. Review of Educational Research, 1976, 46, 613-630.